



Employment and Appointments Committee

Date:	Monday, 23 April 2012
Time:	6.00 pm
Venue:	Committee Room 3 - Wallasey Town Hall

Contact Officer: Andrew Mossop
Tel: 0151 691 8501
e-mail: andrewmossop@wirral.gov.uk
Website: <http://www.wirral.gov.uk>

SUPPLEMENTARY AGENDA

6. ANY OTHER URGENT BUSINESS APPROVED BY THE CHAIR
7. RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION OF SOCIAL WORKERS AND SOCIAL WORK MANAGERS IN CHILDREN AND YOUNG PEOPLE'S DEPARTMENT (Pages 1 - 16)

This page is intentionally left blank

WIRRAL COUNCIL

EMPLOYMENT AND APPOINTMENTS COMMITTEE

23 APRIL 2012

SUBJECT:	RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION OF SOCIAL WORKERS AND SOCIAL WORK MANAGERS IN CHILDREN AND YOUNG PEOPLE DEPARTMENT
WARD/S AFFECTED:	ALL
JOINT REPORT OF:	BILL NORMAN, DIRECTOR OF LAW, HR & ASSET MANAGEMENT AND DAVID ARMSTRONG, DIRECTOR OF CHILDREN'S SERVICES
RESPONSIBLE PORTFOLIO HOLDER:	COUNCILLOR TOM HARNEY
KEY DECISION?	YES

1.0 EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- 1.1 The purpose of this report is to bring to member's attention serious difficulties in the recruitment and retention of Social Work staff in Children and Young People's Department (CYPD), comparing salaries with other North West Authorities, with a recommendation to extend the current market rate supplement.
- 1.2 The recommendation in the report should have a positive impact on the current additional spend on agency staffing.

2.0 BACKGROUND AND KEY ISSUES

2.1 Generic Recruitment and Retention Issues

- 2.1.1 Wirral is experiencing difficulty recruiting and retaining high calibre social worker managers to lead and manage a team of social workers and ensure the effective management of high level child protection cases.
- 2.1.2 There is evidence to support that Wirral Council are paying lower salary levels than other local authorities in the North West of England.
- 2.1.3 In order to address the significant concerns around recruiting retaining high calibre social worker managers there is a need to take immediate action due to the number of expensive agency social work managers being used to cover permanent vacancies, which cannot be filled due lack of high calibre candidates applying for the posts. This arrangement is not conducive to consistent standards of quality service

2.1.4 The Hay Job Evaluation Scheme will determine the level of grade for Social Workers within Wirral. The National Social Worker Task Force has identified factors that need to be included across the range of Social Work posts.

2.1.5 The Proposed National Social Worker grade.

In the final report of the National Joint Council (NJC) working party on social worker recruitment and career progression, the NJC working on social worker recruitment and career progression was established in January 2010 in response to the findings of the national Social Work Task Force.

The working party produced an interim report and recommendations in March 2010. The key recommendations were that the NJC should consider:

- a. endorsing the Social Work Task Force's national career framework
- b. producing a series of benchmark job profiles with suitably moderated job evaluation scores
- c. promulgating a national agreement requiring councils to review roles against the benchmark profile evaluations
- d. examining allied roles to ensure scope for professional qualification, and core responsibilities for supporting registered social workers are clearly defined
- e. obtaining legal advice to provide an equal pay risk assessment

Both Local Government Employers and the Trade Unions agreed that it was important to clarify any possible equal pay issues arising from the recommendations in the report.

This will be considered as part of the quality assurance of the job evaluation stage 3 process.

2.2 Children and Young People's Services

2.2.1 Immediate pressures affecting the department include

- a) Other North West Local Authorities are paying significantly more than Wirral. The neighbouring authority of Cheshire West and Chester are attracting applications from Practice Managers in Wirral, as they are paying up to £9,000 more per annum as a minimum salary for a similar role.
- b) There is currently a high level of unfilled key social work manager posts remaining vacant or covered by agency at additional cost, due to lack of remuneration.
- c) Front line Practice/Team Managers interface between Social Workers and families are stretched as a result of being unable to fill vacant posts and due cover provided by agency staffing.
- d) The children's social care structure, approved 2 years ago, has never been fully recruited to over that period, despite advertising regularly.

- e) There is a significant level of risk due to dependency on agency staff at Social Worker/Advanced Practitioner/Advanced Social Worker, Practice/Team Manager and Principal Team Manager level.

2.2.2 Long Term Issues

Dependant on the outcome of job evaluation of specific posts in Children's Social Care, the issue relating to remuneration in comparison with other local authorities salary levels and /or supply agency costs may be affected.

3.0 RISKS

- 3.1 The proposal addresses what is one of the most significant areas of risk for the Council, to ensure that qualified and experienced social care staff are recruited and retained to address the needs of vulnerable children.
- 3.2 The risks to the external assessment e.g. OFSTED of children's Social Care could be compromised and the reputation of the Council will be affected
- 3.3 The risks to safeguarding of children could be compromised if the current levels of vacancies/agency staff continues, which is resulting in substantive staff taking on larger case loads and continuity of service for families.

4.0 OTHER OPTIONS CONSIDERED

- 4.1 The proposals seeks to extend an existing scheme of market rate supplement. The payment of market rate supplements forms part of our pay policy agreed at employment and appointment committee on 28th February 2012 and agreed at Council on 1 March 2012.
- 4.2 The Director of Children and Young People's Department does have delegated authority to implement the proposals under the current Scheme of Delegation regulation Schedule 4 Para 28(a). However elected member approval for this proposal is sought.

5.0 CONSULTATION

- 5.1 The trade unions have been informed of the proposal and would not be in agreement. Their concerns lie with the grading and pay across all social care staff. It is also the case that the introduction of the Golden Hello in 2003 did not have trade union agreement

6.0 RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION INCENTIVES CURRENTLY USED

6.1 Golden Hello for Newly Qualified Social Workers in Children's Services

- 6.1.1 Within Children's Services current golden hello payments are paid to newly qualified social workers, which provide £2,000 to social workers who complete their training and remain with the department for at least two years (Date & Committee agreement – Employment and Appointments Committee on 24th July 2003)

6.1.2 The numbers of appointments that the Golden Hello has been applied to since the process began in 2003 has been 126. This has resulted in a cost of £240,000, over the period. Six of the Social Workers left the Authority within the first two years of being appointed and the cost of their Golden Hellos was recovered.

6.2. Essential Car User Allowance

6.2.1 All Social Workers automatically receive essential car user allowance, where they evidence that they use a car for work purposes, have the necessary insurance documents and make first car mileage claim.

6.2.2 The essential car user allowance lump sum payment ranges from £846 - £1,239 per annum plus a mileage allowance of between 36.9p – 50.5p per mile.

7.0 CURRENT POSITION ON TURNOVER AND VACANCIES (DETAILS CAN BE FOUND IN APPENDIX 1)

7.1 Children's Services

7.1.1 *Social Workers, including Advanced Social Worker and Senior Practitioners

- a) There are currently 148 x *Social Worker established posts, and a 9.45% vacancy rate equivalent to 14 x Social Worker posts.
- b) *Social Worker vacancies are being advertised on average once every 3 months, costing approximately £84,000 over the last 2 years
- c) *Agency Social Worker cover is currently running at 17% of established social work post. *NB this figure includes vacancies, sickness absence cover, and staff acting up into manager posts.*
- d) Social Work turnover is currently running at 9.2% of the establishment, compared to 5% across the council
- e) 53% of the Social Workers currently employed have 2 years or less service, which has a impact on the number and type of cases that can be undertaken, and the risks associated with child protection cases.

7.1.2. Practice/Team Managers

- a) There are currently 16 x Practice/Team Managers established posts, and a 25% vacancy rate equivalent to 4 x Practice/Team Managers posts.
- b) Practice/Team Managers vacancies are being advertised on average once per month, costing approximately £84,000 over the last 2 years
- c) Agency Practice/Team Managers cover is currently running at 12.5% of established social work post. *NB this figure includes vacancies, sickness absence cover, and staff acting up into manager posts.* In addition there is one Agency Practice/Team Manager who has been employed for more than 12 months

- d) Practice /Team Managers work turnover is currently running at 8.3% of the establishment, compared to 5% across the council.

7.1.3 Principal Team Managers

- a) There are currently seven x Principal Team Manager established posts, and a 57% vacancy rate equivalent to four x Principal Team Manager posts.
- b) Principal Team Managers vacancies are being advertised on average once every four months, costing approximately £24,500 over the last two years.
- c) Agency Principal Team Managers cover is currently running at 43% of established Principal Team Manager posts. *NB this figure includes vacancies, sickness absence cover, and staff acting up into manager posts.* In addition there are two Agency Principal Team Manager who have been employed for 6 -12 months

8.0 BENCHMARK GRADING FOR COMPARATIVE POSTS WITH OTHER NORTH WEST LOCAL AUTHORITIES (SEE APPENDIX 2)

8.1 Social Workers Current Salary Scale SCP26-36 (£22,221 - £30,011)

8.1.1 Wirral is offering significantly less on average than other North West local authorities.

8.1.2 The starting salary in Wirral for a newly qualified social worker is £22,221 pa compared to an average of £25,919 pa (a difference of £3,698 pa).

8.1.3 The maximum salary payable in Wirral for to a qualified social worker is £30,011pa compared to an average of £32,696 pa (a difference of £2,685 pa).

8.2 Practice/Team Managers (Children's Services) Current Salary Scale PO8 (£33,361 – £36,313)

8.2.1 Wirral is offering significantly less on average than other North West local authorities.

8.2.2 The starting salary in Wirral for a Practice/Team Manager is **£33,361 pa** compared to an average of £37,337 (a difference of £3,676)

8.2.3 The maximum salary payable in Wirral for to a Practice/Team Manager is £36,313pa compared to an average of £42,441 (a difference of £6,128)

8.3 Principal Team Manager (Children's Services Only) Current Salary PO12 (£37,206 – £39,885)

8.3.1 Wirral is offering significantly less on average than other North West local authorities.

8.3.2 The starting salary in Wirral for Principal Team Manager (CSC) is £37,206 pa compared to a similar post in Cheshire West and Chester £42,000 (a difference of £4,794)

8.3.3 The maximum salary payable in Wirral for to a Principal Team Manager is £39,855 pa, compared to similar Cheshire West and Chester £48,000 (a difference of £8,145).

9.0 Agency staffing costs

9.1 Social Workers

9.1.1 On average the council are paying £32.00 per hour including charges paid as part of contract to an agency. This cost equates to an annual salary of £52,000 pa, which is a significant additional cost compared to directly employed staff at the top of their grade i.e. £14,186 additional cost (including on costs), per agency member of staff

9.1.2 Based on the current number of agency staffing this equates to an additional annual cost of £141,186 (based on agency staff remaining in post for 12 months).
NB This would equate approximately to an additional 3.73 x FTE post based on max of grade and on costs

9.2 Practice/ Team Managers (CYPD)/ Team Manager

9.2.1 On average the council are paying £50 per hour including charges paid as part of contract to an agency. This cost equates to an annual salary of £81,000pa, which is a significant additional cost compared to directly employed staff at the top of their grade i.e. £35,245 additional cost (including on costs), per agency member of staff

9.2.2 Based on the current number of agency staffing this equates to an additional annual cost of £70,490 (based on agency staff remaining in post for 12 months)
NB This would equate approximately to an additional 1.54 FTE post based on max of grade and on costs

9.3 Principal Team Manager

9.3.1 On average the council are paying £55 per hour including charges paid as part of contract to an agency. This cost equates to an annual salary of £89,000 which is a significant additional cost compared to directly employed staff at the top of their grade i.e. £38,744 additional cost (including on costs) per agency member of staff

9.3.2 Based on the current number of agency staffing this equates to an additional annual cost of £267,000 (based on agency staff remaining in post for 12 months)
NB This would equate approximately to an additional 5.3 FTE post based on max of grade and on costs

10.0 COMPARISON WITH DEPARTMENT OF ADULT SOCIAL SERVICES

10.1 In analysing the issues across the Children and Young People's Department this exercise has also been completed across adult social services. Over the past three years there has been very little turnover or recruitment. Recent recruitment has

resulted in full appointment. However it has identified an issue of pay differentials across authorities. This meant that a number of appointable candidates withdrew from the process.

10.2 There is a requirement to look further at Department of Adult Social Services staff in terms of workforce planning issues. There is a risk of adult social care staff being disaffected by the extension of the market rate supplement however the data supporting recruitment and retention issues does not justify extending to adult social services at this stage

10.3 Comparative data in shown in appendix 5.

11.0 RECOMMENDED SHORT TERM MARKET SUPPLEMENT (SUBJECT TO THE OUTCOME OF JOB EVALUATION)

11.1 It is recommended that the current 'golden hellos' recruitment payment is extended to the following:

- Practice/ Team Managers x 4 vacant posts
- Principal Team Manager x 4 vacant posts

Details are outlined below this will be reviewed when the outcome of the job evaluations stage process is known

11.2 An additional retention payment will be payable to the following

- Social Workers x 134 posts
- Practice Managers x 12 posts
- Principal Team Manager x 3 posts

Details are outlined below this will be reviewed when the outcome of the job evaluations stage process is known

11.3 Short term Market Supplement for Children's Social Care Posts

Short Term Market Supplement	Detail	Cost
Social Workers (including Advanced Social Workers and Senior Practitioners)	£2, 000 Continue to pay a recruitment payment for all new starters (already paid to CS social workers as a Golden Hello) Employee must stay for 2 years or repay either all (if leaves in first 12 months) or % if leaves in 2 nd year and £2,000 Retention payment for	No Additional Cost, as the department is already committed to this recruitment payment Based on current staffing

	<p>existing staff who have not received recruitment payment in the previous 2 years. Employee must stay for 2 years or repay either all (if leaves in first 12 months) or % if leaves in 2nd year</p>	<p>level this would result in a cost £268,000 at the end of 2 years</p>
Short Term Market Supplement	Detail	Cost
Practice/Team Manager	<p>£3, 000 Recruitment payment for all new starters Employee must stay for 2 years or repay either all (if leaves in first 12 months) or % if leaves in 2nd year and £3,000 Retention payment for existing staff (who have not received recruitment payment in the previous 2 years). Employee must stay for 2 years or repay either all (if leaves in first 12 months) or % if leaves in 2nd year</p>	<p>Based on current turnover this would result in £12,000 Based on current staffing level this would result in a cost of £48,000 at the end of 2 years</p>
Principal Team Manager (CYPD)	<p>£3000 Recruitment payment for all Employee must stay for 2 years or repay either all (if leaves in first 12 months) or % if leaves in 2nd year and £3000 Retention payment for existing staff. Employee must stay for 2 years or repay either all (if leaves in first 12 months) or % if leaves in 2nd year</p>	<p>Based on current turnover this would result in £12,000 Based on current staffing level this would result in a cost of £9,000 at the end of 2 years</p>

12.0 IMPLICATIONS FOR VOLUNTARY, COMMUNITY AND FAITH GROUPS

12.1 There are no additional implications as a result of this report.

13.0 RESOURCE IMPLICATIONS: FINANCIAL; IT; STAFFING; AND ASSETS

- 13.1 The overall impact of the proposal would result in a projected net reduction in expenditure on vacancies of £241,720 (See appendix 4)

Overall Impact	Cost
Indicative overspend on staffing and recruitment costs	£590,720
Potential full year cost from the extension of market supplement	£349,00
Potential Reduction in Overspend	£241,720

14.0 LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

- 14.1 No specific legal implications arise as a result of this report.
- 14.2 Leading Counsel has advised in relation to implications for other staff in relation to Job Evaluation issues

15.0 EQUALITIES IMPLICATIONS

- 15.1 An Equality Impact Assessment has been published.

<http://www.wirral.gov.uk/my-services/community-and-living/equality-diversity-cohesion/equality-impact-assessments/eias-2010/law-hr-asset-management>

16.0 CARBON REDUCTION IMPLICATIONS

- 16.1 No specific carbon reduction implications arise as a result of this report.

17.0 PLANNING AND COMMUNITY SAFETY IMPLICATIONS

- 17.1 No specific planning and community safety implications arise as a result of this report.

18.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

- 18.1 The Employment and Appointments Committee agree the extension of the market rate supplement to the following:

- Social Workers - retention only (as recruitment payment is already paid)
- Practice /Team Managers – recruitment and retention payment
- Principal Team Managers - recruitment and retention payment

- 18.2 To bring back to the Employment and Appointments Committee a review of the payments once the job evaluation process is complete

- 18.3 To bring back a further report to the Employment and Appointments Committee addressing wider workforce issues across all social care staff both in adults and children's,

- 18.4 That members agree the implementation of the recommended short term recruitment and retention payments for CYPD. This will be funded from the £1million EIG prevention budget for CYPD.

19.0 REASONS FOR RECOMMENDATION/S

19.1 To ensure that the Recruitment and Retention of staff is not jeopardised by neighbouring north-west authorities offering better salaries.

REPORT AUTHOR: Chris Hyams

telephone: 0151 691 8590

email: chrishyams@wirral.gov.uk

APPENDICES

Appendix 1 – Social Care recruitment and retention data

Appendix 2 - Comparative Benchmarking Data with other Local Authorities

Appendix 3 - Number of posts filled and vacancies in Children's Services

Appendix 4a - Comparative cost of staffing establishment against current approximate staffing costs

Appendix 4b - Cost of short term Market Supplement Proposal and overall impact

Appendix 5 - Comparative Workforce Data CYPD v DASS

Appendix 1 - Recruitment and Retention Data

Issue	CYPD		
	Social Worker/ Advanced Social Worker/ Senior Practitioner	Practice/ Team Manager	Principal Team Manager
Numbers on the establishment	148	16	7
Numbers of posts currently filled	134	12	3
%	90.5%	75%	42.8%
Number of Vacancies	14	4	4
%	9.5%	25%	57.2%
Recruitment Advertising			
	*Social Worker Only	Practice/ Team Manager	Principal Team Manager
No of posts advertised in last 3 years	33 (in the last two years)	11	8
No of times advertised	20	9	7
% of posts filled	92.1%	75%	42.8%
Length of time in post			
Up to 1 year	19	4	0
1 < 2 years	49	6	3
3 < 4 years	7	0	0
Length of Time in post			
4 < 6 years	22	0	0
6 < 8 years	11	1	0
9 < 11 years	3	0	0
11+ years	7	1	0
Turnover			
2009/10	15.3%	0	N/A
2010/11	8.8%	15.3%	0
2011/12	9.2%	8.3%	0
Agency cover			
Length of time			
1- 3 months	18	1	0
3 – 6 months	3	0	1
6 – 12 months	1	0	2
More than 12 months	0	1	0
Proportion of staff on top of grade			
	28.3%	25%	25%

Appendix 2 - Comparative Benchmarking Data with other Local Authorities

SOCIAL WORKERS SCP 26-36

Number of Authorities	£ minimum paid	Number of Authorities	£ maximum paid
1	£22,221.00	2	£30,011.00
5	£24,646.00	4	£32,800.00
2	£25,472.00	3	£31,754.00
2	£26,276.00	2	£32,800.00
1	£27,052.00	1	£34,549.00
3	£27,849.00	1	£35,430.00
1	£29,236.00	1	£37,206.00
		1	£38,961.00
Average	£25,919.00	Average	£32,696.00
Wirral	£22,221.00	Wirral	£30,011.00
Average Difference	£3,698.00	Average Difference	£2,685.00

Senior Social Workers/Advance Practitioners

PO4

Number of Authorities	£ minimum paid	Number of Authorities	£ maximum paid
2	£28,236	1	£31,754
3	£31,754	1	£32,800
1	£32,800	1	£33,661
3	£33,661	1	£34,549
1	£34,207	1	£35,430
1	£34,549	4	£37,206
6	£35,430	4	£38,042
1	£36,182	3	£38,961
		1	£39,885
		1	£42,014
Average	£33,352	Average	£36,430
Wirral	£30,011	Wirral	£32,800
Average Difference	£3,341	Average Difference	£3,630

PRACTICE TEAM MANAGER

PO8

Number of Authorities	£ minimum paid	Number of Authorities	£ maximum paid
1	£33,661	4	£38,961
1	£34,549	2	£39,855
2	£35,430	2	£40,741
1	£36,313	6	£41,616
2	£37,206	1	£43,403
3	£38,042	1	£44,309
5	£38,961	2	£48,200
1	£39,855		
2	£42,014		
Average	£37,337	Average	£42,441
Wirral	£33,661	Wirral	£36313
Average Difference	£3,676	Average Difference	£6,128

PRINCIPAL TEAM MANAGER PO12

Local Authority	£ minimum paid	Local Authority	£ maximum paid
Cheshire West and Chester	£42,000	Cheshire West and Chester	£48,000
Wirral	£37,206	Wirral	£39,855
Difference	£4,794	Difference	£8,145

Appendix 4a– Comparative cost of staffing establishment against current approximate staffing costs

	Establis hment Number	Indicative Costs	Current staff no. in post	Current Cost of staffing	Current Agency Staffing (vacancies only)	Current annual recruitment advertising costs	Current cost of Staff	Net Overspend
Social Worker (Senior Practitioner/ Advanced Social Worker)	148	* £5,596,472	134	£5,067,076	£728,000	£42,000	£5,837, 076	£240,604
Practice/Team Manager (CYPD) Team Manager (DASS	16	£732,064	12	£549,048	£324,000	£42,000	£915,048	£182,984
Principal Team Manager	7	£351,519	3	£150,651	£356,000	£12,000	£518,651	£167,132
Total		£6,680,055		£5,766,775	£1,408,000	£96,000	£7,270,775	£590,720

* based on top of the scale for Social workers

Appendix 4b– Cost of short term Market Supplement

Cost of Short Term Market Supplement			
Job Role	Recruit Allowance (based on turnover)	Retention Allowance	Total Cost
Social Workers/Senior Social Workers/Advanced Practitioners	No additional cost	£268,000	£268,000
Practice/Team Manager (CYPD) Team Manager (DASS)	£12,000	£48,000	£54,000
Principal Team Manager	£12,000	£9,000	£12,000
	£24,000	£325,000	£349,000

Overall Impact of short term market supplement	Cost
Indicative Overspend on staffing and recruitment costs	£590,720
Potential full year cost from extension of market supplement	£349,00
Potential Reduction in Overspend	£241,720

Appendix 5 - Comparative Workforce Data CYPD v DASS

Issue	CYPD			DASS (FTE shown)		
	Social Worker	Practice/ Team Manager	Principal Team Manager	Social Worker	AMHP	Team Manager
Numbers on the establishment	148	16	7	57.3	39.5	25.5
Numbers of posts currently filled	134	12	4	53.54	35.98	24.5
%	90.5%	75%	42.8%	93.4%	91.1%	96%
Number of Vacancies	14	4	4	3.76	3.52	1
%	9.5%	25%	57.1%	6.6%	8.89%	3.9%
Agency cover						
Length of time						
1- 3 months	18	1	0	4	0	2
3 – 6 months	3	0	1	0	0	1
6 – 12 months	1	0	2	0	0	0
More than 12 months	0	1	0	2	0	0
Advertising						
Number of posts advertised in last three years	33 (in the last two years)	11	8	5	4	4
Number of times advertised	20	9	7	2	2	3
% of posts filled	92.1%	75%	42.8%	100%	100%	86%